
MAIN CASE

Proposal: Erection of four bedroom house and single garage

Location: Site Adjacent to Sapele Dyson Drove Burwell

Applicant: Mr Gurden Singh Tiwana

Agent: Solo Designs

Reference No: 14/00547/FUL

Case Officer: Ed Fosker

Parish: Burwell

Ward: Burwell

Ward Councillor/s: Councillor David Brown

Date Received: 24 April 2014 Expiry Date: 31 July 2014

[P68]

1.0 EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- 1.1 This application seeks full planning permission for the erection of 1no. four bedroom detached dwelling and single garage and should be read in conjunction with application No. 14/00551/FUL – Erection of two detached houses on site adjacent to Sapele, Dyson Drove.
- 1.2 The Council cannot currently demonstrate a robust five year housing supply and therefore the policies within the Core Strategy relating to the supply of housing should not be considered up-to-date. In light of this, applications for housing development, such as this one, should be considered in the context of the presumption in favour of sustainable development as set out in the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF).
- 1.3 This application for 1 residential dwelling, would go some way to address the five year housing supply shortfall, which the Planning Inspector has advised amounts to 320 dwellings. The benefit of this development is therefore the contribution it would make in terms of housing supply within the District as a whole as well as the economic benefits of construction and additional population to support local businesses.
- 1.4 The key considerations in determining this application are therefore: whether any adverse impacts would significantly and demonstrably outweigh the benefits of the development, as set out above, when assessed against the policies in the NPPF taken as a whole and against the policies within the Core Strategy which do not

specifically relate to the supply of housing; or, whether any specific policies within the NPPF indicate that the development should be restricted.

- 1.5 The character of the street scene consists in the immediate vicinity predominantly of single storey properties which front the existing highway. The proposed dwellings would result in a contrived form of development, at odds with the prevailing pattern of development in the surrounding area and would not to preserve or enhance the character of Burwell Conservation Area.
- 1.6 This application is therefore recommended for REFUSAL.
- 1.7 This application has been called-in to Committee by Councillor David Brown.

A Site visit has been arranged for 10.45am, prior to the Planning Committee meeting.

2.0 THE APPLICATION

- 2.1 Full planning permission is being sought to erect a four bedroom house and single attached garage. The proposed dwelling measures 10.6m x 16.9m with a ridge height of 8m sloping to 2.4m at the eaves. A single garage is proposed to be attached to the southern end of the dwelling.

3.0 THE APPLICANT'S CASE

- 3.1 The Applicant's case is set out in the Design and Access Statement, which can be viewed online via East Cambridgeshire District Council's Public Access online service, via the following link <http://pa.eastcambs.gov.uk/online-applications/>. Alternatively a paper copy is available to view at the East Cambridgeshire District Council offices, on the application file.

4.0 THE SITE AND ITS ENVIRONMENT

- 4.1 The site which is situated on the northern side of Dyson Drove once comprised a densely vegetated site located within the Burwell North Street Conservation Area. The single-storey bungalow which occupied the site has since been demolished and the site cleared. A gated access is sited towards the centre of the site; this currently provides vehicular access to the site. The front boundary was originally dominated by a beech hedge at a height of 3m and a number of mature trees (including an Ash, Oak and Beech) the hedge has since been cut down and thinned drastically (this is the subject of an ongoing enforcement investigation as part of the hedging was to be retained under the permission No. 11/00618/FUL). There are a number of mature trees along the northern and western boundary of the site, together with a hedge at a height of approximately 3m. The site is located within the settlement boundary for Burwell and is sited in a residential area, where the prevailing form is single-storey detached bungalows.

5.0 PLANNING HISTORY

- 5.1 14/00551/FUL: Erection of two detached houses – currently under consideration
- 5.2 11/00618/FUL: Demolition of existing bungalow and garage and the construction of two bungalows – granted: 25.02.2013
- 5.3 10/00533/FUL: Demolition of existing bungalow and garage and the construction of two new houses – withdrawn: 19.08.2010
- 5.4 10/00111/CAC: Demolition of existing bungalow – granted: 12.04.2010
- 5.5 10/00082/FUL: Demolition of existing bungalow and construction of three new houses – withdrawn: 25.03.2010

6.0 REPLIES TO CONSULTATIONS

6.1 Neighbours:

Occupiers of Cherry Orchard and 1 Dysons Grove raise concerns with regard to:

- Proposed development not in keeping with surroundings
- Height is too high compared to neighbouring bungalows
- Would lead to additional traffic on an already frequently used narrow road
- Development on conservation land
- Houses on Dyson Grove are not needed with proposed developments on Ness Road and Newmarket Road

6.2 Swaffham Internal Drainage Board: No objections

6.3 Environmental Health: No objections

6.4 Scientific Officer: Environmental Services:

Reports of unauthorised land filling/tipping on this site with materials from demolished bungalow – potential infilling of land/contamination

6.5 Burwell Parish Council: No objections

6.6 Conservation Officer: Consent should not be granted from a conservation point of view

- Heritage statement inadequate
- Creation of 3 dwellings inappropriate and would constitute to over development causing harm to character and appearance of conservation area
- Site can accommodate a maximum of 2 dwellings of a much smaller scale- site would appear cramped
- Buildings proposed are bland and show no architectural merit
- Use of 'fake' timber on the gable end is not appropriate

6.7 Highways:

- Local Highways Authority request that the plans show dimensions of accesses, car parking layout and manoeuvring area.
- Following provision of this information the Highways Authority is satisfied with the proposals subject to conditions.

6.8 Trees:

- Concern that the boundary hedging which was conditioned to be partly retained in the previous application for two bungalows on this site has been completely removed
- Given the proximity of the proposed development to the lime and walnut trees it is considered unsustainable in terms of tree protection and would lead to the loss or permanent damage of these trees.

7.0 **THE PLANNING POLICY CONTEXT**

7.1 East Cambridgeshire Core Strategy 2009

CS1	Spatial Strategy
CS2	Housing
EN1	Landscape and settlement character
EN2	Design
EN5	Historic conservation
S6	Transport impact
S7	Parking provision

7.2 East Cambridgeshire Local Plan (Feb 13)

ENV1 - Green infrastructure
ENV2 - Landscape Conservation
ENV11 – Conservation Areas
COM7 - Transport impact
COM8 - Parking provision
GROW2 - Locational strategy

7.3 Supplementary Planning Documents

Design Guide

8.0 **CENTRAL GOVERNMENT POLICY**

8.1 National Planning Policy Framework 2012

- | | |
|---|--|
| 6 | Delivering a wide choice of high quality homes |
| 7 | Requiring good design |

9.0 PLANNING COMMENTS

- 9.1 The Council cannot currently demonstrate a robust five year housing supply and therefore the policies within the Core Strategy relating to the supply of housing should not be considered up-to-date. In light of this, applications for housing development, such as this one, should be considered in the context of the presumption in favour of sustainable development as set out in the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF).
- 9.2 This application for 1 residential dwelling, would go some way to address the five year housing supply shortfall, which the Planning Inspector has advised amounts to 320 dwellings. The benefit of this development is therefore the contribution it would make in terms of housing supply within the District as a whole as well as the economic benefits of construction and additional population to support local businesses.
- 9.3 The key considerations in determining this application are therefore: whether any adverse impacts would significantly and demonstrably outweigh the benefits of the development, as set out above, when assessed against the policies in the NPPF taken as a whole and against the policies within the Core Strategy which do not specifically relate to the supply of housing; or, whether any specific policies within the NPPF indicate that the development should be restricted.
- 9.4 Principle
The application site is located within the settlement boundary of Burwell, and therefore residential development on this site is considered to be acceptable in principle subject to any adverse impact on residential amenity, the character of the Conservation Area and existing street scene.
- 9.5 Impact on street scene
The application site is located on the edge of Burwell fronting Dyson Drove which is rural in character and forms part of a transitional zone between the main built up part of the settlement to the countryside beyond. The application site was subject to extensive discussions in 2010/11 to secure an appropriate, high quality design for two single storey, contemporary dwellings on the site.
- 9.6 This application must be considered alongside 14/00551/FUL which seeks consent for two dwellings. The site has been divided into three plots and two separate applications submitted. The creation of three dwellings of the sizes proposed would be inappropriate and would constitute overdevelopment of the site, causing significant harm to the character and appearance of the Conservation Area.
- 9.7 The proposed design and scale of the 1.5 storey dwelling is excessive in size and bulk, with a number of dormer windows to both the front and rear elevations and a detached single garage. The property is bland and show no architectural merit in comparison to the previously approved scheme which was of a high quality contemporary design. Whilst the materials may be appropriate for the area, the fenestration and detailing is old fashioned and cluttered.

- 9.8 The roof design appears somewhat contrived, the lower projecting front gable and half hips to the garage and side elevation. Also the windows to the front gable are not in proportion with the others to the front elevation not allowing the proposal to sit comfortably in the wider street scene.
- 9.9 Whilst the proposed dwellings may comply with the recommendations in the Council's Design Guide SPD in regards to plot size and coverage, the character of this part of the village is that of a rural street, leaving the village and opening up into the countryside. There are a number of properties within the vicinity of the site that sit in large plots. The size of the dwellings is not appropriate and would result in a cramped appearance on the site when combined with the application on the adjacent site.
- 9.9.1 The previously approved scheme was very low key in nature and had a minimal impact on the street scene and whilst contemporary in nature it was a positive addition that was deemed to enhance the character of the Conservation Area.
- 9.9.2 The replacement scheme as submitted would ultimately create 3 overly large dwellings that would be visually dominant in the street scene, detracting from the rural character of Dyson Drove and causing substantial harm to the Conservation Area.
- 10.0 Residential amenity
With regard to loss of residential amenity to neighbouring properties the proposed dwelling would be situated 23m away from the property to the eastern side (Sapele), 25m away from the property to the north eastern side and 20m (across Dyson Drove) from the property to the south eastern side. Therefore it is not considered that there would be a loss of residential amenity currently enjoyed by the occupiers of these properties by reason of overlooking or overbearing impact.
- 11.0 Trees
The front boundary hedge has been removed and is the subject of an ongoing enforcement investigation. This proposal for one dwelling when considered in conjunction with the application for two dwellings or even as a standalone application will lead to significantly adverse harm to the existing Walnut (T1) and Lime (T2) as detailed in A.T. Coombes Associates Arboricultural Impact Assessment which are positioned 2.1m and 1.5m away from the rear of plot 3.
- 12.0 Conclusion
The application site is located on the edge of Burwell fronting Dyson Drove which is rural in character and forms part of a transitional zone between the main built up part of the settlement to the countryside beyond where the character of the street scene consists in the immediate vicinity predominantly of single storey properties which front the existing highway.
- 12.1 It is considered that the proposal, to erect one new dwelling on this site (especially when read in conjunction with 14/00551/FUL – Erection of two detached dwellings) would by reason size, scale and bulk result in a contrived form of development, out of character with the prevailing pattern of development in the surrounding area, Also it would cause substantial harm to the character of Burwell Conservation Area. The

proposal would therefore be contrary to the adopted Core Strategy, Draft Local Plan and the adopted Design Guide.

- 12.2 The adverse impact that this proposal would have on Burwell Conservation Area would significantly and demonstrably outweigh the benefits of the development, the contribution it would make in terms of housing supply within the District as a whole as well as the economic benefits of construction and additional population to support local businesses when assessed against the policies in the NPPF.

13.0 **RECOMMENDATION**

RECOMMENDATION: Refusal

- 1 The application site is located on the edge of Burwell fronting Dyson Drove which is rural in character and forms part of a transitional zone between the main built up part of the settlement to the countryside beyond. The introduction of a '1.5 storey' dwelling by itself, and also when considered in the context of the application on the adjacent site (ref: 14/00551/FUL); in this location where the immediate street scene largely consists of single storey properties which front the existing highway would by reason of their size, scale, bulk and cumulative impact result in a contrived form of development, at odds with the general context and appearance of the immediate area and would adversely affect the character of the Drove. It would also cause substantial harm to the setting of the Burwell Conservation Area. The proposal fails to comply with policy EN5 of the adopted Core Strategy 2009 and policy ENV11 of the Draft Local Plan 2014, which seek to ensure that development would preserve or enhance the setting of the Conservation Area.

14.0 **APPENDICES**

None.

<u>Background Documents</u>	<u>Location(s)</u>	<u>Contact Officer(s)</u>
14/00547/FUL 14/00551/FUL	Ed Fosker Room No. 011 The Grange Ely	Ed Fosker Planning Officer 01353 665555 ed.fosker@eastcambs.gov.uk