
MAIN CASE

Reference No: 19/00978/FUL

Proposal: Two storey and single storey rear extensions along with demolition of existing single garage & erection of double carport (revised proposals following approval 17/00607/FUL)

Site Address: 70 West Street Isleham Ely Cambridgeshire CB7 5RA

Applicant: Mr & Mrs Wayne Dick

Case Officer: Emma Barral, Planning Officer

Parish: Isleham

Ward: Fordham And Isleham

Ward Councillor/s: Julia Huffer
Joshua Schumann

Date Received: 9 July 2019 **Expiry Date:** 9th October 2019

[U84]

1.0 **RECOMMENDATION**

1.1 Members are recommended to REFUSE this application for the following reason:

The proposed two storey rear extension would cause significant and demonstrable harm to the visual amenity of the host building and character and appearance of the surrounding area given the depth of the projection to the rear proposed. The proposed extension fails to visually protect or enhance the streetscene by virtue of the depth of projection which is considered to be disproportionate to the scale of the original dwellinghouse. This visual dominance is considered to result in harm to the character and appearance of the dwellinghouse and that of the surrounding area and streetscene given the visibility and intrusive nature of the proposed extension from various points on the public highway, the Public Right of Way and on the private driveway that leads to Hall Farm. The proposal is therefore contrary to Policies ENV1 and ENV2 of the East Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2015 and the Design Guide SPD.

At a height of 5.1 metres, the proposed replacement double garage/carport is considered to compete with the original dwellinghouse and is not considered to be of a scale that is subservient and appropriate forward of the building line of the dwellinghouse. The size, scale and location of the proposed double garage/carport is considered to result in harm to the character and appearance of the

dwellinghouse and the surrounding area given the excessive height and scale proposed contrary to Policy ENV2 of the Local Plan 2015.

2.0 SUMMARY OF APPLICATION

- 2.1 The application submitted seeks planning permission for two storey and single storey rear extensions along with demolition of existing single garage & erection of double carport. The proposed two storey element would project 5.5 metres with a width of 6.8 metres and a total height of 6.6 metres. The proposed single storey element would project 5.5 metres and 4.6 metres to the rear of the dwellinghouse to create a staggered projection with a total width of 9.5 metres. The proposal would also include a utility space to the northern facing side elevation measuring 3.7 metres by 2.1 metres. The proposed replacement double garage/carport would measure 6.6 metres by 6.5 metres and would have an eaves height of 2.3 metres and a total height of 5.1 metres. The proposed materials of construction would be matching as far as possible to ensure that the extension assimilates well with the character and appearance of the dwellinghouse.
- 2.2 The application follows a recent approval under LPA Ref 17/00607/FUL which was for a two storey and single storey rear extensions, demolition of existing single garage & erection of double carport. Amended plans were received during the course of the application, reducing the two-storey depth of the proposed extension and reducing the height of the proposed carport, following officer concerns. The approved extensions resulted in a proposed development that projected 3.6 metres from the rear wall at two storey with a width of 6.3 metres with a total height of 6.6 metres. The single storey element projected 4.8 metres to the rear of the dwelling and wrapping around the north side of the existing dwelling with a maximum ridge height of 4 metres and eaves height of 2.4 metres. The proposed double garage carport proposed a total height of 4 metres with a ridge height of 2.5 metres, which was significantly reduced in height from the originally submitted scale.
- 2.3 In total, from the extension granted under LPA Ref 17/00607/FUL, the rear projections have increased from 3.6 metres to 5.5 metres at two storey and from 4.8 metres to 5.5 metres and 4.6 metres at single storey in projection from the original rear wall of the dwellinghouse. The double carport/garage has increased in height by 1.1 metres.
- 2.4 The application was called-in to Planning Committee by Councillor Schumann who has provided comments that “we have considered a number of similar applications where the alterations are minor but appreciate the that you feel it tilts the balance with regards to the impact of the proposed. I believe in this case the application would benefit from the opinion of the committee”.
- 2.5 The full planning application, plans and documents submitted by the Applicant can be viewed online via East Cambridgeshire District Council’s Public Access online service, via the following link <http://pa.eastcambs.gov.uk/online-applications/>. **Alternatively a paper copy is available to view at the East Cambridgeshire District Council offices, in the application file.**

3.0 PLANNING HISTORY

17/00607/FUL	Two storey and single storey rear extensions, demolition of existing single garage & erection of double carport	Approved	13.06.2017
--------------	---	----------	------------

4.0 THE SITE AND ITS ENVIRONMENT

4.1 The site is located to the north of West Street and to the east of Hall Barn Road, accessed via a private road connected to West Street. The site is located within the established development envelope for Isleham, however the density of the built form within the surrounding vicinity of the site is very low. The site comprises a two-storey cottage style dwelling with a detached flat roof garage to the north side. The site has a large garden to the rear of the dwelling and there is a public footpath which runs through the application site, adjacent to the northern boundary. There are Grade II listed buildings located approximately 30-40m to the north of the application site, within the grounds of Hall Farm.

5.0 RESPONSES FROM CONSULTEES

5.1 Responses were received from the following consultees and these are summarised below. The full responses are available on the Council's web site.

Local Highways Authority - 22 July 2019- The Highways Authority has no objections in principal to this application.

Isleham Parish Council - 6 August 2019- No concerns, other than the need for considerations to be attached in relation to the close proximity of this development to the adjacent grade 2, listed building.

Ward Councillors - No Comments Received

Cambridge Ramblers Association - No Comments Received

ECDC Trees Team - 2 August 2019- No tree related objections to this application. Please also note that the trees lining the access road are covered by a tree preservation order and extra care should be taken when any plant or materials are delivered to site to avoid damage to the trees and any resulting prosecution.

Asset Information Definitive Map Team - 22 July 2019- Commented that Public Footpath 14 Isleham runs adjacent to the application site. No objections to the proposed development however the application should be aware of the presence of the public right of way and suggest the following Informatives:

- Public Footpath 14 Isleham must remain open and unobstructed at all times. Building materials must not be stored on Public Rights of Way and contractors' vehicles must not be parked on it (it is an offence under s 137 of the Highways Act 1980 to obstruct a public Highway).

- Landowners are reminded that it is their responsibility to maintain boundaries, including trees, hedges and fences adjacent to Public Rights of way, and that any transfer of land should account for any such boundaries (s154 Highways Act 1980)
- The Highways Authority has a duty to maintain Public Rights of Way in such a state as to be suitable for its intended use. (S41 Highways Act 1980 and S66 Wildlife & Countryside Act 1981). If Public Footpath 14 Isleham is damaged as a result of increased motorised vehicle usage, the Highways Authority is only liable to maintain it to a footpath standard. Those with private vehicular rights will therefore be liable for making good the surface of the Public Right of Way.
- The granting of planning permission does not entitle a developer to obstruct a Public Right of Way (Circular 1/09 para 7.1).
- Developers should follow the County Council's guidance on boundary treatment to ensure it does not result in obstruction and maintenance problems, available online at www.cambridgeshire.gov.uk/definitivemap

5.2 Neighbours – Five neighbouring properties were notified and the responses received are summarised below. A full copy of the responses are available on the Council's website.

62 West Street, Isleham- Concerns relating to the demolition of the existing garage to the front/side of the dwellinghouse as the driveway is shared use for the five households accessed from West Street. Concerns for highway safety.

6.0 The Planning Policy Context

6.1 East Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2015

GROWTH 2	Locational strategy
ENV 1	Landscape and settlement character
ENV 2	Design
ENV12	Listed Buildings
COM 8	Parking provision

6.2 Supplementary Planning Documents

Design Guide

6.3 National Planning Policy Framework 2019

12 Achieving well-designed places
16 Conserving and enhancing the historic environment

7.0 PLANNING COMMENTS

7.1 Principle of Development

- 7.1.1 The main issues to consider in the determination of this application are the impact it may have on the residential amenity of nearby occupiers and the impact it may have on the visual appearance of the dwellinghouse, surrounding area and street scene and parking provision. The site is within the development envelope, where in principle extensions to residential properties are considered acceptable subject to compliance with the relevant planning policies plus all other material planning considerations that form part of the planning balance for this application.
- 7.1.2 The application follows a recent approval under LPA Ref 17/00607/FUL which was for a two storey and single storey rear extensions, demolition of existing single garage & erection of double carport. The original plans submitted with the application proposed a 5.5m deep two-storey extension. The depth of this extension was considered by the Planning Officer to be disproportionate to the scale of the existing dwelling and would be visually detrimental to the appearance of the existing dwelling. However, amended plans were received which reduced the two-storey element of the proposed extension to 3.6m which appeared more subservient to the existing dwelling and did not create a significant detrimental impact upon the appearance of the dwelling. The current application proposes a two storey projection of 5.5 metres from the rear of the dwellinghouse which is the same projection as the original plans submitted for LPA Ref 17/00607/FUL.
- 7.2 Visual Amenity
- 7.2.1 Policies ENV1 and ENV2 of the Local Plan 2015 requires proposals to ensure that location, layout, scale, form, massing, materials and colour relate sympathetically to the surrounding area and each other.
- 7.2.2 In terms of visual amenity, the proposed two storey rear extension would not be visible from the front of the dwellinghouse and the dwelling is visually isolated from other dwellings with a large residential curtilage surrounding it. However given the siting of the dwellinghouse the proposed two storey rear extension would be visible from several surrounding viewpoints including from West Street between Number 72 and 74, from the dwellinghouses at Hall Farm to the north of the application site, from the Public Right of Way to the north of the application site (moving from west to east) and its link from Temple Road/ Hall Barn Road to the west. Therefore, the character and appearance of the dwellinghouse would be altered and would be highly visible within the street scene, from the Public Right of Way and from the public highway.
- 7.2.3 The Design Guide SPD states that when a dwelling has been extended the original building should still be clearly legible and pre-dominate. Any extension should also be subservient to the existing dwelling. Given the depth of the projection of 5.5 metres, the proposed two storey rear extension is considered to result in development that is disproportionate to the scale of the existing dwellinghouse. As the total depth of the existing dwellinghouse is 4.9 metres when measured from the principle elevation to the original rear wall of the dwellinghouse, the proposed extension is greater in depth. Together with a ridge height similar to the existing and the excessive depth of projection, the proposed extension would be overly-prominent to the existing dwellinghouse resulting in a bulky and dominant extension

that would be visually detrimental to the character and appearance of the existing dwellinghouse.

- 7.2.4 The proposed two storey rear extension is considered to result in significant and demonstrable harm to the character and appearance of the dwellinghouse, surrounding area and street scene given the excessive scale and dominance of the proposed extension that would not be subservient to the existing dwellinghouse. This over-prominence given the size, scale and location of the proposed two storey rear extension would be visible from several surrounding viewing points in public highway and private driveway leading to Hall Farm and would therefore be visually intrusive within the streetscene contrary to Policies ENV1 and ENV2 of the Local Plan 2015 and Design Guide SPD.
- 7.2.5 The proposed double-bay carport would replace an existing single garage which is of a poor quality appearance. Officers raised concerns during the course of the application LPA Ref 17/00607/FUL and the height of the proposed garage was subsequently reduced to 4 metres with a ridge height of 2.5 metres. In the current application the height has been increased to 5.1 metres which is considered to compete with the original dwellinghouse and is not considered to be of a scale that is subservient and appropriate forward of the building line of the dwellinghouse. The size, scale and location of the proposed double garage/carport is considered to result in harm to the character and appearance of the dwellinghouse and the surrounding area given the excessive height and scale proposed contrary to policy ENV2 of the Local Plan 2015.
- 7.2.6 There is no concern in relation to the single storey elements by way of harm to visual amenity. The external surfaces of the proposed extensions and car port would predominantly be constructed of materials to match, or closely match, the existing dwelling. The choice of materials would ensure that the proposed extensions and carport are sympathetic to the appearance to the existing dwelling and would be of a high quality appearance.
- 7.3 Historic Environment
- 7.3.1 There are Grade II listed buildings located to the north of the site, located within the grounds of Hall Farm. The nearest listed building is located more than 30m from boundary of the application site and the proposed carport, and 45m from the dwelling which would be extended. By virtue of its distance from any neighbouring properties, the proposed extension and carport would not create any significant detrimental impacts upon the character, appearance or setting of the listed buildings. The level of harm to the setting of listed buildings is considered to be extremely minimal with no harm caused. It is therefore considered that the proposal complies with Policy ENV12 of the East Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2015.
- 7.4 Residential Amenity
- 7.4.1 By virtue of its height, scale and distance from any neighbouring properties, the proposed extension and carport would not create any significant detrimental impacts upon neighbouring properties. It is therefore considered that the proposal complies with Policy ENV2 of the East Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2015 in respect of residential amenity.

7.5 Parking Provision

7.5.1 The proposed development would replace an existing single garage with a two bay carport, improving the parking provision for the dwelling by providing 2 car parking spaces which accords with the Council's parking standards set out within Policy COM8 of the East Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2015.

7.6 Planning Balance

7.6.1 The proposed two storey rear extension does not have a detrimental impact on car parking for the site and does not cause unacceptable harm to the residential amenity of the neighbouring occupiers. However, it is considered that this is outweighed by the proposed development causing significant and demonstrable harm to the visual amenity of the existing building and character of the surrounding area. The proposed development fails to visually protect or enhance the streetscene by virtue of the depth of projection which is considered to be disproportionate to the scale of the original dwellinghouse. This visual dominance is considered to result in harm to the character and appearance of the dwellinghouse and to that of the surrounding area given the visibility and intrusive nature of the proposed extension from various viewpoints on the public highway to the south, from the Public Right of Way to the north (and moving from west to east) and on the private driveway to the east that leads to Hall Farm to the north of the application site.

7.6.2 In addition, the height of the proposed double garage/carport is considered to compete with the original dwellinghouse and is not considered to be of a scale that is subservient and appropriate forward of the building line of the dwellinghouse. The proposed double garage/carport would therefore result in harm to visual amenity.

7.6.3 The proposal is therefore contrary to Policies ENV1 and ENV2 of the East Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2015 which require all proposed developments to be of high quality design and to protect or enhance the distinctive character of the area.

<u>Background Documents</u>	<u>Location</u>	<u>Contact Officer(s)</u>
19/00978/FUL	Emma Barral Room No. 011	Emma Barral Planning Officer
17/00607/FUL	The Grange Ely	01353 665555 emma.barral@eastc ambbs.gov.uk

National Planning Policy Framework -
https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/6077/2116950.pdf

East Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2015 -
<http://www.eastcambbs.gov.uk/sites/default/files/Local%20Plan%20April%202015%20-%20front%20cover%20and%20inside%20front%20cover.pdf>